

IMPLEMENTATION OF STREET VENDOR RESTRUCTURING POLICY IN THE CITY OF CIREBON

ISKANDAR ZULKARNAEN¹, BAMBANG HERU PURWANTO² and ALI ANWAR³

¹ Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon, Indonesia.

^{2,3} Universitas Pasundan, Bandung, Indonesia.

E-mail: hijjaztrans@gmail.com¹, bambangherupurwanto@unpas.ac.id², yusufalianwar@yahoo.co.id³

Abstract

The study was conducted to analyze the implementation of street vendors (PKL) structuring policies in Cirebon City, analyse the factors that lead to the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in the city of Cirebon has not been effective, and to design an effective strategy to optimize the implementation of PKL structuring policies in Cirebon City. The research was conducted using qualitative methods. Data was collected by studying literature, observation, interviews, documentation studies, and Focus Group Discussion. Data analysis was carried out through stages, namely data reduction, data display, as well as verification and drawing conclusions. While testing the validity of the data is done by using the technique of triangulation. The results of the study are: The implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City has not been effective as seen from the various problems, obstacles, weaknesses, and inconsistencies in its implementation. The factors that cause the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City is not yet effective, namely the form of the message, Effective strategies for optimizing i The implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City based on the SWOT Analysis is SO (Strength-Opportunity) strategy, ST (Strength-Threat) strategy, WO (Weakness-Opportunity) strategy, and WT (Weakness-Threat) strategy.

Keywords: policy, policy implementation, street vendors, street vendor arrangement.

Introduction

Cirebon City is one of the cities in West Java Province that continues to grow rapidly. Cirebon City, like other cities, facing the problem of the proliferation of street vendors (PKL). Based on data from the Office of Cooperatives, Small, Medium Enterprises, Trade and Industry of Cirebon City, the number of street vendors in Cirebon City in 2016 reached around 1,400 but in 2021 this increased to 1621. This number does not include illegal street vendors whose numbers are almost the same.

The proliferation of street vendors in the city of Cirebon has caused problems of order, cleanliness and beauty of the city, as well as causing congestion on various roads. Therefore, street vendors must be managed effectively. The Cirebon City Government since 2014 has begun to seriously organize street vendors by establishing various regional policies in the form of:

1. Mayor of Cirebon Regulation No. 27 of 2014 concerning Structuring and Empowering Street Vendors in the City of Cirebon.
2. Decree of the Mayor of Cirebon Number 511.3.05/Kep.403-DPPKUMKM/2015 concerning the Establishment of a Coordination Team for the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors in Cirebon City.

3. In 2016, Mayor Regulation Number 27 of 2014 was upgraded to Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2016 concerning the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors in Cirebon City. With the enactment of Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2016, the arrangement and empowerment of street vendors has a stronger legal basis.
4. Cirebon Mayor Circular Letter Number 300/019-DPKUKM/2016 concerning Appeal to Entrepreneurs, Community, and Government Agencies to Participate in Managing Street Vendors Around their respective Offices.
5. Cirebon Mayor Decree Number 511.3/Kep.244-DPKUKM/2018 about the Free Zone for Street Vendors in Cirebon City. PKL Free Zones are in six road sections that have been designated as Traffic Order Areas (KTL), namely:
 - a. Siliwangi Street
 - b. RA Kartini Street
 - c. Dr. Street. Wahidin Sudirohusodo
 - d. Dr. Street. Cipto Mangunkusumo
 - e. Dr. Street. Sudarsono
 - f. Youth Street

According to Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2016, p The arrangement of street vendors is an effort made by local governments through the determination of assisted locations to determine, transfer, control, limit and eliminate street vendors' locations by taking into account the public interest, social, aesthetic, health, economy, security, order, environmental cleanliness and in accordance with the laws and regulations. -invitation. However, the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City based on the various regional policies has not been effective as seen from the various problems, obstacles, weaknesses, and inconsistencies in its implementation in the field.

The purpose of this research is to:

1. Analyzing the implementation of street vendor structuring policies in the city of Cirebon.
2. Analyze the factors that lead to the implementation of street vendor structuring policies in the city of Cirebon not yet effective.
3. Designing an effective strategy to optimize the implementation of the street vendor arrangement policy in the city of Cirebon.

Research methods

This research was conducted using qualitative research methods. Qualitative research according to Creswell (2014) is a method to explore and understand the meaning that – by a number of individuals or groups of people – is ascribed to social or humanitarian problems.

Data collection in this study was carried out using literature study, observation, interviews, documentation studies and Focus Group Discussion (FGD). Data analysis was carried out using qualitative data analysis through the stages of data reduction, data display, as well as verification and drawing conclusions (Miles & Huberman, 1992). While checking the validity of the data is carried out using triangulation techniques, namely checking the validity of data that utilizes something other than the data (other sources, methods, investigators and theories) for checking purposes or as a comparison against the data (Moleong, 2009). In addition to using qualitative data analysis, the study also uses SWOT analysis (Rangkuti, 2015) to identify internal factors in the form of Strengths and Weaknesses and external factors in the form of Opportunities and Threats. faced in the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City. Based on the results of the SWOT analysis, an effective strategy can be formulated to optimize the implementation of PKL structuring policies in Cirebon City.

Theory Overview

Public policy is a policy set by government agencies and apparatus (Anderson, 2000). Public policy is government action aimed at several problems (Peterson, 2003). Public policy is whatever the government chooses to do or not to do (Dye, 1975). Public policy is what the government actually does, and not what it intends to do (Anderson, 2000). Every government action can be called a public policy and every public policy has predictable consequences (Winarno, 2011). KPublic policy also has the nature of "coercion" which is potentially legitimate. This coercive nature is not shared by policies taken by private organizations, this means that public policy demands broad compliance from the community. This last characteristic is what distinguishes public policy from other policies (Winarno, 2011). According to Anderson (2000), the public policy process consists of five steps, namely problem formulation, policy formulation, policy determination, implementation, and evaluation. The same is saidDunn (1994) that public policy has five important stages, namely agenda setting, policy formulation, policy adoption, policy implementation, and policy evaluation. Of the five processes, the implementation of public policy is a very important process. This is emphasized by Udoji (Wahab, 2010) that policy implementation is something important than policy making because the policies that have been made will only be dreams or good plans that are stored neatly in the archives if the policy is not implemented. The success of public policy implementation is influenced by many factors or variables. Many experts put forward the factors or variables that affect the successful implementation of these public policies.

Van Metter and Van Horn (1975) suggest four factors that influence the implementation of public policy, namely:

1. Implementation activities and inter-organizational communication.
2. Characteristics of implementing agents / implementers.
3. Economic, social and political conditions.
4. Tendency (disposition) of the implementer.

Edwards III (1980:10) suggests that the successful implementation of public policy is influenced by four factors, namely:

1. Communication(communication)
2. Resources(sources)
3. Disposition(disposition)
4. Bureaucratic structure(bureaucratic structure).

Rondinelli & Cheema (1983:56) suggest four factors that influence public policy, namely:

1. Environment conditions(environmental conditions).
2. Inter-organizational relationship(relationships between organizations).
3. Resources for program implementation(resources for program implementation).
4. Characteristics of implementation agencies(characteristics of implementation agents).

Smith (Tachjan, 2006) says there are four factors that need to be considered in the implementation of public policy, namely:

1. The idealized policy.
2. The target group (target group).
3. Implementing organization (implementing organization).
4. Environmental factors (environmental factors).

Meanwhile Goggin et al (1990) suggested three factors that influence the implementation of public policy, namely:

1. Message content, including:
 - a. Policy clarity
 - b. Message credibility as a solution
 - c. Policy consistency.
2. The form of the message, including:
 - a. Policy efficiency
 - b. Society participation
 - c. Message repetition frequency
 - d. Policy type
 - e. Policy recipient

3. Perceptions of leadership, including:
 - a. Resource
 - b. Legitimacy of regional leaders who make policy
 - c. Leadership credibility.

Research Results and Discussion

Implementation of Street Vendor Arrangement Policy in Cirebon City

The implementation of PKL structuring policies in Cirebon City are as follows:

1. Many street vendors do not have a TDU (Business Registration Certificate) as one of the obligations for street vendors.
2. The road sections that are designated as Traffic Order Areas (KTL), which are PKL-free areas are not yet PKL-free. This can be seen from the number of street vendors selling on the six protocol roads designated as KTL.
3. The awareness of street vendors is not yet optimal, which is only orderly selling when there is a raid by the Satpol PP, but again it is not orderly to sell if there is no raid.
4. There are still many street vendors who sell outside the shelters set by the Cirebon City Government because the location of the shelter is not strategic so there are no buyers.
5. There are street vendors who trade or rent out their stalls at the PKL shelter to other street vendors.
6. Weak law enforcement, namely: many street vendors violate obligations and prohibitions but are not given strict sanctions, so they return to selling in KTL which is a forbidden location for street vendors.
7. Not optimal participation from entrepreneurs and government agencies in managing street vendors around their respective offices.
8. Lack of knowledge and participation from buyers regarding prohibitions and sanctions if buying from street vendors in locations that are prohibited for street vendors.
9. The performance of the Coordination Team for the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors in Cirebon City is not yet optimal.

Factors Causing the Implementation of Street Vendor Arrangement Policies in Cirebon City have not been effective

In this study, the factors that caused the implementation of PKL structuring policies in Cirebon City were not yet effectively analyzed based on the theory of public policy implementation from Goggin et al (1990) as follows:

1. Message Content

a. Policy clarity

The PKL structuring policy has completely regulated the PKL structuring in the form of Regional Regulations, the old Mayor Regulations which have been upgraded to Regional Regulations, Mayor Decrees, and Mayor Circulars. The PKL structuring policy has also clearly regulated the PKL structuring but Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2016 regarding the arrangement and empowerment of street vendors in the city of Cirebon until now there has been no Mayor Regulation as a derivative and its implementing regulations.

The understanding of the DKUKMPP apparatus and the Cirebon City Satpol PP regarding the PKL structuring policy is relatively good. However, many street vendors, especially illegal street vendors, do not know and understand the PKL structuring policy.

b. Message credibility as a solution

The contents of the PKL structuring policy in the form of Regional Regulations, Mayor Regulations, Mayor Decrees, and Mayor's Circulars on paper have high credibility in overcoming PKL problems in Cirebon City. These various policies are a solution to overcome the problem of street vendors in the city of Cirebon.

However, the results of the implementation of the PKL structuring policy have not been optimal. This can be seen from the many problems and obstacles in its implementation.

c. Policy consistency

Among the PKL structuring policies in the form of Regional Regulations, Mayor Regulations, Mayor Decrees, and Mayor Circulars are consistent, that is, they do not conflict with each other. These policies are consistent, that is, they do not change, so they do not confuse the implementing apparatus in the field. Policies for structuring street vendors are also in sync and complement each other with policies in other fields.

However, there are still inconsistencies between the PKL structuring policy and its implementation due to the intervention of the regional head (Cirebon Mayor) for personal and group interests. For example, the PKL shelter next to the Kejaksan Square had to change its layout because the mayor's family was going to sell at the shelter.

2. Message Form

a. Policy efficiency

The efficiency of the PKL structuring policy is seen from the use of funds/budget in its implementation, even though the funds/budget is inadequate. The efficiency of the PKL structuring policy is seen from the energy in its implementation, although the number of the Cirebon City Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) is limited.

The efficiency of the PKL structuring policy seen from the time in its implementation has also been efficient even though the PKL control cannot be carried out routinely due to limited personnel and budget.

b. Society participation

The participation of street vendors in the arrangement of street vendors is not optimal because there are still quite a number of street vendors who violate the rules. Meanwhile, the participation of the PKL Forum in structuring PKL is quite optimal as an extension of the PKL and Cirebon City Government partners in structuring PKL. However, the participation of the community/buyers in structuring street vendors is not optimal because there are still many people/buyers who buy from street vendors in locations that are prohibited for street vendors.

The participation of companies in the arrangement of street vendors has not been optimal because only a few companies have participated in the arrangement of street vendors through CSR (Corporate Social Responsibility) activities. The participation of universities in the arrangement of street vendors is also not optimal because only a few universities actively participate in the arrangement of street vendors. Likewise, the participation of government agencies in the arrangement of street vendors has not been optimal because only a few government agencies participate in the arrangement of street vendors.

c. Message repetition frequency

The frequency of repetition of messages is in the form of socializing the PKL structuring policy to the relevant stakeholders. The socialization of the PKL structuring policy has been carried out in a programmed and planned manner in accordance with the available funds/budget. The socialization of the PKL structuring policy has also been carried out regularly and continuously in accordance with the available funds/budget. Socialization is carried out directly to street vendors or through WhatsApp groups. However, the socialization of the PKL structuring policy has not been optimal because there are still quite a number of street vendors who violate the rules. In addition, many people/buyers also do not know that buying from street vendors in locations that are prohibited for street vendors can be subject to sanctions.

d. Policy type

The nature of the PKL arrangement policy is hybrid or a mixture of bottom up or top down because it is determined by the Cirebon City Government by involving the Cirebon City PKL Forum. The PKL structuring policy has also accommodated the interests of all stakeholders, namely the Cirebon City Government and PKL. The PKL structuring policy is actually not detrimental to the PKL. This is because the policy of structuring street vendors does not actually prohibit street vendors from selling. Street vendors are still allowed to sell but not in locations that are prohibited for street vendors.

e. Policy recipient

PKL can accept the policy of structuring street vendors even though they initially objected. PKL's understanding of street vendors' structuring policies is not optimal because not all street vendors understand the rights, obligations and prohibitions of street vendors. On the other hand, the awareness and compliance of street vendors is not optimal because there are still quite a number of street vendors who violate their obligations. This is especially the case for illegal street vendors who have not received any socialization of the PKL structuring policy.

3. Perception of Leaders

a. Resources

The number of the Cirebon City Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) is not yet optimal. The number of officers is only 62 people, including 40 field officers, with the status of Civil Servants (PNS). While the ideal number of officers is 150 people. The number of officers with the status of Civil Servant Investigators (PPNS) authorized to take action on street vendors who commit violations is also not optimal, namely only 2 people, this causes street vendors to not be controlled regularly. The competence of the apparatus is not optimal, especially the competence of the Satpol PP apparatus as PPNS (Civil Servant Investigators). The discipline of the apparatus is optimal because the apparatus carries out their duties with discipline. The motivation of the officers is also optimal because the officers carry out their duties with high motivation. The attitude of the apparatus is optimal because the apparatus in structuring and controlling street vendors prioritizes a humane and persuasive approach. Funds/budgets for the operational arrangement of street vendors are less than optimal, namely the amount is minimal. Facilities (facilities and infrastructure) in the arrangement of street vendors are less than optimal, especially operational vehicles and occupational health and safety facilities for Satpol PP officers. Data and information in the arrangement of street vendors are optimal because they are supported by complete data and information.

b. Legitimacy of regional leaders who make policy

The legitimacy or authority of regional leaders is optimal because regional leaders (Regional Heads / Mayors of Cirebon) have great legitimacy or authority in carrying out the arrangement of street vendors. Acceptance and acknowledgment to the leadership is optimal because the subordinate/executive apparatus accepts and recognizes the regional leadership (Regional Head/Mayor) as the highest leader in the Cirebon City Government. Compliance of subordinate officers to optimal leadership. This is because subordinate/executive officers obey the regional leadership (Regional Head/Mayor) as the highest leader in the Cirebon City Government.

c. Leadership credibility

Political will and leadership commitment in the optimal arrangement of street vendors. This right is because the Regional Head/Mayor of Cirebon has a strong political will and commitment to structuring street vendors as seen from the stipulation of various regional policies governing street vendors. The leadership's vision and mission in structuring street vendors is optimal because the Regional Head (Mayor of Cirebon) has a vision and mission related to structuring street vendors. Innovation and creativity of leaders in structuring street vendors are also optimal because the Regional Head (Mayor of Cirebon) carries out various innovations and creativity in structuring street vendors. The leadership's ability to deal with street vendors is quite optimal because the Regional Head/Mayor of Cirebon can overcome street vendors' problems even though until now the street vendors' problems have not been completely resolved. The leadership's ability to coordinate related agencies in structuring street vendors is also optimal because the Regional Head (Cirebon Mayor) is able to act as a director in the Coordination Team for PKL Arrangement and Empowerment in Cirebon City.

In addition to these factors, the author also finds novelty in the form of factors not mentioned by Goggin (1990) in his theory, namely:

1. Synergy through cooperation, coordination and collaboration, namely the synergy between stakeholders in structuring street vendors in the city of Cirebon which is not yet optimal. In fact, this synergy is important because the arrangement of street vendors requires the participation of all stakeholders.
2. The mentality is the mentality of street vendors which tends to be difficult to manage, making it difficult to organize street vendors.

An effective strategy to optimize the implementation of the street vendor arrangement policy in the city of Cirebon

Based on the SWOT analysis, it is known that the internal factors in the form of Strengths and Weaknesses and external factors in the form of Opportunities and Threats faced in the implementation of PKL structuring policies in Cirebon City are as follows:

1. Strength

Strengths that are owned in the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in the city of Cirebon are:

- a. The Cirebon City Government has a complete policy that regulates the arrangement of street vendors. The policies are in the form of Regional Regulations, Mayor Regulations, Mayor Decrees, and Mayor Circulars.
- b. The Cirebon City Government has a clear policy that regulates the arrangement of street vendors. In the policy in the form of Regional Regulations, Mayor Regulations, Mayor Decrees, and Mayor Circulars, matters related to the arrangement of street vendors in Cirebon City have been clearly regulated.
- c. The existence of political will and a strong commitment from the regional head (Cirebon Mayor) to realize the arrangement of street vendors. This strong political will and commitment is evident from the existence of Regional Regulations, Mayor Regulations, Mayor Decrees, and Mayor Circulars that regulate the arrangement of street vendors in Cirebon City.
- d. In the city of Cirebon a Coordination Team for the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors has been formed. With this team, the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City can be carried out in an integrated, integral and coordinated manner.
- e. In the city of Cirebon there is a PKL Forum which is a forum for street vendors and partners for the Cirebon City Government in structuring street vendors.
- f. In the city of Cirebon there is a bachelor of street vendors who helps the Cirebon city government in organizing street vendors.

- g. The participation of companies, universities, and government agencies to participate in managing street vendors.

2. Strength (Weakness)

Weaknesses in the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City are:

- a. There is no Mayor Regulation as a derivative of the Regional Regulation Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2016 concerning Structuring and Empowering Street Vendors in Cirebon City.
- b. Street vendors are difficult to regulate because the awareness of street vendors is not optimal, so there are still quite a number of violations committed by street vendors.
- c. The number of Cirebon City Satpol PP officers with civil servant status is inadequate. This is because to ensure legal certainty, the enforcement and control of street vendors must be carried out by officials with civil servant status.
- d. Funds/budgets in the APBD for structuring street vendors are inadequate.
- e. Limited facilities (facilities and infrastructure) for structuring street vendors such as to build PKL shelters, operational vehicles for Satpol PP, and others.
- f. There is still a sectoral ego between SKPD in coordinating the arrangement of street vendors.

3. Opportunity

Opportunities faced in implementing the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City are:

- a. There is a budget outside the APBD for structuring street vendors such as from CSR funds, grants, Government and Business Entity Cooperation (KPBU), and others.
- b. It is still possible to recruit Satpol PP officers with civil servant status in stages according to the formation and available budget.

4. Threats

Threats faced in implementing the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City are:

- a. Deteriorating economic conditions have led to an increase in the number of street vendors, making it difficult to organize street vendors.
- b. It is feared that the replacement of regional heads will cause policy changes in the arrangement of street vendors.

Based on the SWOT analysis, the effective strategies to optimize the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City are:

1. The SO (Strength-Opportunity) strategy is carried out by using the Strengths possessed to take advantage of the Opportunities faced, namely:
 - a. Increase the participation of companies, government agencies, and universities in

- structuring street vendors.
- b. Increasing the role of the PKL Forum and PKL Companion Scholars in structuring street vendors.
 - c. Improve the performance of the Coordination Team in structuring street vendors.
2. The ST (Strength-Threat) strategy is carried out by using the Strengths possessed to overcome the Threats faced, namely:
- a. Continue to prioritize the arrangement of street vendors as one of the priority programs, despite the change of regional heads.
 - b. Increase regional economic growth and expand employment opportunities in the region.
3. The WO (Weakness-Opportunity) strategy is carried out by minimizing the Weaknesses possessed to take advantage of the Opportunities encountered, namely:
- a. Make a Mayor Regulation as a derivative or implementing regulation of Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2016 concerning the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors in the City of Cirebon.
 - b. Increase the allocation of funds/budget from the APBD for structuring street vendors.
 - c. Utilizing various alternative sources of financing from outside the APBD such as CSR funds, grants, and others.
 - d. Gradually increase the number of Satpol PP officers with civil servant status in accordance with the ability of the APBD.
 - e. Improving facilities (facilities and infrastructure) in the arrangement of street vendors.
 - f. Conducting socialization and education on the arrangement of street vendors on a massive scale by involving the PKL Forum, PKL Companion Scholars, and universities.
 - g. Increase the participation of companies, government agencies, and universities in structuring street vendors.
4. The WT (Weakness-Threat) strategy is a strategy that minimizes the Weaknesses and avoids the Threats faced, namely:
- a. Increase regional economic growth because it has a multiplier effect on various fields including street vendors.
 - b. Choose a regional head who really has the political will and a strong commitment in structuring street vendors.

Conclusion

The implementation of PKL structuring policies in Cirebon City has not been effective as seen as seen from various problems, obstacles, weaknesses, and inconsistencies in the implementation of Regional Regulations, Mayor Regulations, Mayor Decrees, and Mayor's Circular which regulates PKL structuring in Cirebon City. The factors that because the implementation of the PKL structuring policy in Cirebon City has not been effective, namely the message form factors, message content and perceptions of leadership and factors that are research novelty. Effective strategies for optimizing implementation of PKL structuring policies in Cirebon City based on SWOT Analysis, namely SO (Strength-Opportunity) strategy, ST (Strength-Threat) strategy, WO (Weakness-Opportunity) strategy, and WT (Weakness-Threat) strategy.

Reference

- Anderson, James E. 2000. Public Policy Making. Boston:Houghton Mifflin
- Creswell, John. W. 2014. Research Design. Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Approach. Yogyakarta: Student Library
- Dunn, Willian N. 1994. Public Policy Analysis: An Introduction. New Jersey: Englewoods Cliffs
- Dye, Thomas R. 1975. Understanding Public Policy. New Jersey: Prentice Hall
- Edwards III, George C. 1980. Implementing Public Policy. Washington: Congressional Quarterly Press
- Goggin, Malcolm L., et al. 1990. Implementation Theory and Practice: Toward and Third Generation. Illinois: Scoot, Forestman and Company
- Miles, Matthew B & Huberman, Michael A. 1992. Qualitative Data Analysis: A Sourcebook of New Methods. London: Sage Publications
- Moleong, Lexy J. 2009. Qualitative Research Methods. Bandung: PT. Rosdakarya Teens
- Peterson, Steven A. 2003. Public Policy. New York: Marcel Dekker
- Rangkuti, Freddy. 2015. SWOT Balanced Scorecard. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama
- Rondinelli, Dennis & Cheema, Shabir (ed.). 1983. Decentralization and Development. Policy Implementation in Developing Countries.USA:Sage Publications
- Tachjan. 2006. Implementation of Public Policy. Bandung: Humanities Van Meter, Donalds and Van Horn, Carl E. 1975. The Policy Implementation Process. A Conceptual Framework. Administration and Society, Vol.6 No. 4, February
- Wow, Solihin Abdul. 2010.Policy Analysis, from Formulation to Implementation of State Policy. Jakarta: Earth Literacy
- Winarno, Budi. 2011. Public Policy. Theory, Process, and Case Studies. Yogyakarta: CAPS